Spanish

Control Project Meeting
Week 6

- Some of the interesting issues in Spanish Control/Raising:
  - Restructuring
    - Some control/raising verbs are restructuring triggers, others are not
  - Preposition + infinitive
    - Some control/raising verbs require particular prepositions to precede an infinitival complement.
  - The controller’s position with object control verbs
    - The controller of an object control verb may precede or follow an infinitival complement.

- Data collection
  - 6 native speakers of Spanish from 3 different areas
  - grammatical judgments tasks to investigate:
    ✓ validity of the control vs. raising distinction
    ✓ validity of the restructuring diagnostics
    ✓ speakers’ preference with the position of the controller in object control

1. Restructuring/Clause Reduction

Aissen & Perlmutter (1976): some control and raising verbs are transparent with respect to normally clause-bound phenomena.

1.1. Clitic Climbing:
- pronominal clitics of an embedded verb’ arguments may appear cliticized on some control/raising verbs:

   1) a. Juan lo quiere comer ec
      J it want-3rdSg eat ec
      ‘Juan wants to eat it.’

   b. *Juan lo insiste en comer ec
      J it insist-3rdSg in eat ec
      ‘Juan insists in eating it.’

1.2. Reflexive Passive:
- an embedded object can be the matrix subject with the reflexive pronoun SE in this impersonal construction:

   2) a. Los mapas se empezaron a preparar ec
      The maps SE begin-3rdPl-pst to prepare ec
      ‘They have begun to prepare the maps.’

   b. *Las pirámides se insisten en visitar ec
      The pyramids SE insist-3rdPl in visit ec
      ‘They insist to visit the pyramids.’

1.3. Long Passive:
- an object of an embedded verb can be passivized:

   3) a. Estas casas fueron empezadas a pintar ti
      These houses be-3rdPl-pst begin-F-Pl to paint ti
These houses were began to paint.
b. *Estas casas fueron insistidas en pintar. These houses be-^{3^{dpi}}pst insist-F-Pl in paint ti
‘These houses were insisted in painting.

1.4. Tough construction (Object Raising):
➢ an embedded object can be “raised”

4) a. Estas casas son fáciles de empezar a pintar ec,
these houses be-^{3^{dpi}} easy DE begin to paint ec,
‘These houses are easy to begin to paint.’

b. *Estas casas son fáciles de insistir en pintar ec,
these houses be-^{3^{dpi}} easy DE insist to paint ec,
‘These houses are easy to insist in painting.’

Table 1: Aissen and Perlmutter’s list of trigger and non-trigger verbs:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Trigger Verbs</th>
<th>Non-trigger verbs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>soler ‘tend’</td>
<td>parecer ‘seem’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>acabar de ‘have just’</td>
<td>deber de ‘must’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>querer ‘want’</td>
<td>insistir en ‘insist in’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tratar de ‘try’</td>
<td>soñar con ‘dream of’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>poder ‘can’</td>
<td>decidir(se) ‘decide’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>deber ‘ought to’</td>
<td>evitar ‘avoid’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empezar a ‘begin’</td>
<td>sugerir ‘suggest’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>terminar de ‘finish’</td>
<td>pedir ‘ask’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>continuar ‘continue’</td>
<td>decir ‘say’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>sequir ‘keep on’</td>
<td>afirmar ‘affirm’</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dejar de ‘stop’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>volver a ‘re-verb’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ordenar ‘order’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>permitir ‘permit’</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 1: Aissen and Perlmutter’s list of trigger and non-trigger verbs:

- Some issues with restructuring:

1.5. Optinality:
➢ restructuring appears to be optional: embedded negation is possible with a downstairs clitic; it is prohibited with an upstairs clitic (Moore 1996):

5) a. *Juan lo quiere no leer pro,
J it want-^{3^{disg}} Neg read pro,
Juan wants to eat it.’

1.6 Variability:
➢ Trigger verbs do not uniformly show the transparent characteristics with all the diagnostics (Moore 1996):

- Only some verbs allow long passive:

6) *Estas casas fueron queridas a vender ti,
These houses be-^{3^{dpi}}pst want-F-Pl to sell ti
‘These houses are wanted to sell.

- Locally bound anaphora can’t be bound:

7) *Curro te lo permitió mardar-si mo,
C it you it permitbe-^{3^{dpi}}pst send-self mo to himself mo,
‘Curro allowed you to send it to himself.’

---

1 For an account of the impossibility of passive and reflexive binding with restructuring trigger verbs, see Moore (1996).
2. Prepositional complements

- Many control/raising verbs take an infinitival complement with a specific preposition.
  - Control verbs:
    - insistir en ‘insist in’
    - soñar con ‘dream of’
    - tratar de ‘try’
  - Aspectual verbs
    - empezar a ‘begin’
    - terminar de ‘finish’
    - dejar de ‘stop’
    - volver a ‘re-verb’
    - acabar de ‘have just’
  - Object control verbs
    - obligar a ‘require’
    - forzar a ‘force’

- What does the complement structure look like with/without a preposition?
- Notice that the prepositions do not have to be adjacent with the verb (at least with object control verbs)

8) Obligaron al editor a publicar el libro
   requir-3rdSg-pst to-the editor A publish the book
   ‘They forced the editor to publish the book.’

- Whether restructuring is analyzed to involve verb raising/incorporation or reduced complement, the presence of these prepositions seems unexpected and problematic.

3. Object control verbs and the controller’s position

Spanish object control verbs like ordenar ‘order’ and permitir ‘permit’ allow the controller to appear either before or after an infinitival complement (i.e. Bordelois 1988).

9) a. El jefe ordenó trabajar a los hombres
   the boss order-3rdSg-pst work to the guys

   b. El jefe ordenó a los hombres trabajar.
   the boss order-3rdSg-pst to the guys work
   ‘The boss told the buys to work.’

- Some have argued that these verbs take just an infinitival complement and the apparent controller belongs to the complement.
- Evidence suggests that the controller and the infinitive do not form a constituent (Moore 1998):
  - Sentential anaphora

10) Mi padre no me permite [salir por la noche],
    my father Neg me permit-3rdSg [go-out for the night]
    pero mi madre sí me permite.
    but my mother yes me it permit-3rdSg
    ‘My father doesn’t permit me to go out at night, but my mother does.’

- Clefting

11) Lo que me permitió fue [barrar la vereda]
    What me permit-3rdSg-pst was [sweep the sidewalk]
    ‘What s/he permitted that I do was sweep the sidewalk.’

---

2 I don’t know whether the same diagnostics can be used with the non-pronominal controller.
This suggests the following two options under the Larsonian analysis of object control (Larson 1991):

a) the controller + infinitive  
   b) infinitive + the controller

Are there two directions for specifiers in Spanish?
   Note that the subject can be either pre- or post-verbal in Spanish:

12) Compró el niño la bicicleta
   Buy-3sg-pst the child the bicycle
   ‘The boy bought the bicycle.’

Is the movement analysis of control compatible with b)?

4. Data
4.1. Subjects:
   6 participants from 3 different regions
   A, B, C, F = Argentina, D = Spain, E = Columbia
   They all came to the US as adults (two in their 20’s, other in their 30’s)
   They have been in the US for:
   A = 8 years D = 3.5 years
   B = 20 years E = 10 months
   C = 20 years F = 6 years

4.2. Tasks
   Grammatical judgment tasks
   - Section 1 & 3 assign each sentence:
     ✓ = a good Spanish sentence
     ? = ok but strange
     ✗ = a bad Spanish sentence or between these.
   - Section 2: truth value equivalence
     S = if a pair of sentences describe the same situation.
     D = if they describe two different situations.

   For section 1 & 3:
   - The given grammatical judgments are given points
     ✓ = 3
     ✓? = 2.5
     ? = 2
     ✗? = 1.5
     ✗ = 1
     the lowest possible = 6; the highest possible = 18
     based on the total score, the acceptability of each sentence is determined as follows:
     6-9 = ✗ (ungrammatical)
4.3. Results

4.3.1. Control vs. Raising

- **Selectional Restrictions:**
  a) **Inanimate Subject**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verb</th>
<th>✓</th>
<th>?</th>
<th>x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>poder ‘can’</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>deber ‘should’</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empezar a ‘begin’</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>terminar de ‘finish’</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>seguir ‘keep on’</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dejar de ‘stop’</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>volver a ‘re-do’</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- **Inanimate Object**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verb</th>
<th>✓</th>
<th>?</th>
<th>x</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>ordenar ‘order’</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>+ subjunctive permitir ‘permit’</td>
<td>✓</td>
<td>?</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Examples:

- ordenar + inanimate object+ infinitive:
  "El jefe [ordenó][las cajas] [ser mandadas a Los Angeles]. (7.5)"
- ordenar + subjunctive:
  "El jefe [ordenó] [que las cajas sean mandadas a Los Angeles]. (16)"

- poder ‘can’
- deber ‘should’
- empezar a ‘begin’
- terminar de ‘finish’
- seguir ‘keep on’
- dejar de ‘stop’
- volver a ‘re-do’

- poder ‘can’
- deber ‘should’

Comments:
- subjects are more tolerant with selectional restrictions on subjects than objects.
- subjunctive complement with and without an object are clearly different.

- c) **Passive synonymy**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verb</th>
<th>Same</th>
<th>Different</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>querer ‘want’</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tratar de ‘try’</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>insistir en ‘insist in’</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>soñar con ‘dream of’</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>decidir ‘decide’</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>evitar ‘avoid’</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>poder ‘can’</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>deber ‘should’</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empezar a ‘begin’</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>terminar de ‘finish’</td>
<td>5</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>continuar ‘continue’</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>seguir ‘keep on’</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>dejar de ‘stop’</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>volver a ‘re-do’</td>
<td>6</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ordenar ‘order’ + infinitive</td>
<td>2</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ordenar ‘order’ + subjunctive</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>permitir ‘permit’ + infinitive</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>permitir ‘permit’ + subjunctive</td>
<td>3</td>
<td>3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>pedido ‘ask’</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>6</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Comments:
- Clear division between the presumed control verbs and aspectual verbs.
- For some, modals are interpreted as root with active, epistemic with passive.
Subjunctive and infinitive under the object control verbs are interpreted differently.

### 4.3.2. Restructuring phenomena
- The presumed trigger verbs:
  - tratar de ‘try’, empezar a ‘begin’
- The presumed non-trigger verbs:
  - insistir en ‘insist in’, parecer ‘seem’

#### Clitic Climbing

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verb</th>
<th>✓</th>
<th>?</th>
<th>×</th>
<th>score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>tratar de ‘try’ + object</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>8.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>tratar de ‘try’ + reflexive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>insistir en ‘insist in’ + object</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>insistir en ‘insist in’ + reflexive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empezar a ‘begin’ + object</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>18.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empezar a ‘begin’ + reflexive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>18.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>parecer ‘seem’ + object</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>parecer ‘seem’ + reflexive</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Reflexive Passive

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verb</th>
<th>✓</th>
<th>?</th>
<th>×</th>
<th>score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>tratar de ‘try’</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>insistir en ‘insist in’</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>10.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empezar a ‘begin’</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>14.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>parecer ‘seem’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Long Passive

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verb</th>
<th>✓</th>
<th>?</th>
<th>×</th>
<th>score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>tratar de ‘try’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>insistir en ‘insist in’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empezar a ‘begin’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>12.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>parecer ‘seem’</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Tough movement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Verb</th>
<th>✓</th>
<th>?</th>
<th>×</th>
<th>score</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>tratar de ‘try’</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>11.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>insistir en ‘insist in’</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>7.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>empezar a ‘begin’</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>13.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>parecer ‘seem’</td>
<td></td>
<td>*</td>
<td></td>
<td>6.5</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Average scores:**
- tratar de ‘try’ 13.1 (trigger/control)
- insistir en ‘insist in’ 9.5 (non-trigger/control)
- empezar a ‘begin’ 15.2 (trigger/raising)
- parecer ‘seem’ 7.5 (non-trigger/raising)

**Comments:**
- Except for clitic climbing, these constructions are relatively marginal irrespective of the type of the matrix verb.
- Overall, these diagnostics do differentiate trigger verbs from non-trigger verbs.
- Clitic climbing with the trigger object control verbs, ordenar ‘order’ and permitir ‘permit’ were marginal.
- Clitic climbing and reflexive passive failed to distinguish tratar de ‘try’, the trigger control verb, and insistir en ‘insist in’ the non-trigger control verb, while long passive and tough movement did differentiate them.
- The difference between empezar a ‘begin’ the trigger raising verb, and parecer ‘seem’, the non-trigger raising verb, appears to be clear.
As has been discussed in the literature, *parecer* 'seem' is exceptionally clearly opaque.

---

4.3.3. The object controller

Both the controller + infinitive and infinitive + the controller are equally preferred:

13) El jefe ordenó [a los hombres] [trabajar].
   The boss ordered [A the guys] [to work]
14) El jefe permitió [a los hombres] [trabajar].
   The boss permitted [A the guys] [to work]
15) El jefe ordenó [trabajar] [a los hombres]
16) El jefe permitió [trabajar] [a los hombres].

---

References:

---

Outstanding questions:
--status of the prepositions in these structures
   Are all the prepositions the same or do they represent different categories?

--differences between infinitival and gerundial complements
   Syntactic?
   Semantic?